

**Recent Trends in American Research in Song Dynasty History:
Local Religion and Political Culture**

© Hilde De Weerd, 2006.

Note: This review is based on a workshop presentation held at Ōsaka City University, January 28, 2006. The Japanese translation of this review has been published as “アメリカの宋代史研究における近年の動向: 地方宗教と政治文化,” 大阪市立大学東洋史論叢(*OCU Asian History*) 15 (2006), 121-138. The copyright for the English version is held by Hilde De Weerd.

Introduction

In the United States the field of Song Dynasty historical research came into its own in the 1980s. During the 1980s around twenty young historians wrote Ph.D. dissertations on Song history and subsequently revised their dissertations into monographs. Many of them started teaching careers in leading centers of undergraduate and graduate education. Twenty years later the research and the researchers of the 1980s still shape the field. In this article I survey two trends evident in scholarly monographs on Song history published between 1990 and 2006. The interest in local religion among social historians and the return to political history are new trends, but an examination of recent work demonstrates the firm hold of the social history of the 1980s on scholarship to date. This article is intended as a descriptive bibliographic essay; it does not offer in-depth critical reviews of the titles included.

The following brief characterization of the scholarship of the 1980s provides essential context for an examination of recent trends in Song history. The most popular subfield in Song Dynasty history during the 1980s was social history, with intellectual history a distant second. The influence of Robert Hartwell's research and teaching directly explains the then emerging interest in social history. By conventional standards,

Hartwell was not the most prolific of Song researchers. The quantity of scholarly publications he produced was small, but a number of his articles, most notably “Demographic, Political, and Social Transformations of China, 750-1550,” radically transformed the field of Song history.

In this article Hartwell argued, based on a large sample of population and biographical data, that demographic changes (especially the shift of the population towards southeast China) and the restructuring of the administrative apparatus (the empowerment of the county at the lowest level of the administrative subdivision and the centralization of supervisory power in a small number of new regional offices as opposed to the much larger number of prefectures) paralleled transformations in the social and political leadership of the Chinese Empire. He concluded that during the late eleventh and early twelfth century a professional elite specializing in government service and constituted of a cohesive and exclusive group of families gave way to local gentry lineages that considered government service one among several strategies to acquire and maintain social and political status (p. 416). After its publication in 1982 this article became required reading in American graduate seminars on imperial Chinese history.

Hartwell’s broad hypotheses about the demographic, social, economic, and political changes in Chinese history between the Tang and Ming Dynasties were further elaborated in the work of a number of students who studied under him at the University of Pennsylvania. Hugh Clark (1991), Valerie Hansen (1990), Robert Hymes (1986), Paul Smith (1991), and Linda Walton (1999) explored different dimensions of the shift from the Northern Song to the Southern Song tracing social and economic change in particular locales or relating it to changes in educational institutions and religious practices, but all

contributed to the explication of Hartwell's model of demographic, economic, and social change. Hartwell's thesis about the redefinition of elite interests and Hymes' elaboration of it as a reorientation from court-centered to localist elite strategies also inspired the work of budding historians working at other American universities. In his social history of the civil service examinations John Chaffee (1985, 1995) related the changing geographical distribution of examination success to Hartwell's findings. Despite disagreements with Hartwell and Hymes on the social meaning of the examinations, he also attributed the continued appeal of the civil service examinations (despite the lowering odds of graduation and the declining chance of entering officialdom through them) to their changed status in elite identity as a status marker rather than a requisite for office. Peter Bol (1992) premised his study of intellectual transitions between the Tang and Song Dynasties on Hartwell's and Hymes' social history of elites.

Social Histories of Religion

During the 1990s Song Dynasty historians turned to local religion. The interest in Song Dynasty religion was not new. Scholars of Chinese religion have consistently written about Buddhist and Daoist doctrinal developments and had already begun to research a wide range of local religious beliefs and practices prevalent during Song times (e.g., Paul Katz, Terry Kleeman, Peter Gregory, Miriam Levering, Stephen Eskildsen, and John McRae, see Stephen Clart for a fuller bibliography). The questions, concepts, and methods used in the work of these scholars differ from those employed in the work of the historians discussed here and that of recent Ph.D. dissertations on Song religious history listed in the bibliography. Broadly speaking, scholars of Song religion have

focused on particular texts and sects in their integrity, or analyzed discrete religious practices such as hagiography and festivals. They situate their research primarily in the context of the history and anthropology of Buddhism, Daoism, and local religion. The historians of local religion discussed here share an interest in the diversity of local religious practice which they deem irreducible to the general categories of Daoism and Buddhism. They further share an interest in the role of elites in the spread of local religion, even though they disagree on the make-up of the elite. As demonstrated below, they frame their work in the context of broader historical questions and specifically place it in the context of the Tang-Song transition. All four studies discussed below also draw from common source material. Hong Mai's *Record of the Listener* (*Yijian zhi* 夷堅志) has been especially useful to social and cultural historians, even though their uses and readings of this collection of reports and stories differ substantially.

Valerie Hansen's *Changing Gods in Medieval China, 1127-1276* (1991) was the first systematic study of Song Dynasty local religion (or "popular religion" in her terms). Relying on Hong Mai's *Record of the Listener* and temple inscriptions, Hansen argues that changes in popular religion accompanied the economic, social, and political changes of the eleventh and twelfth centuries. Twelfth-century Chinese confronted a wider pantheon of gods and opted for those gods who proved most efficacious (ling 靈). Religious affiliation with the great traditions of Buddhism, Daoism, and Confucianism played no significant role in determining lay persons' worship of gods.

Hansen relates changes in the nature of the gods and in their relationships with human beings to the localist turn and to the commercialization of Song society. She points out that many of the new gods were local heroes of the recent past. Starting in the

late eleventh century these local gods were increasingly incorporated into the official pantheon, as the state hastened to harness the power of efficacious gods through the granting of titles and temple plaques. Official recognition gave rise to competition among local elites to have the gods they supported included in the official pantheon. Local elite involvement in temple construction and their efforts to have local gods recognized thus provided opportunities to literate elites who had “turned away from national politics” to develop local networks (p. 164).

Commercialization determined the activity of the gods. Lay persons attributed commercial savvy to the gods and asked for assistance in commercial undertakings. Commercialization is for Hansen also a factor in the changing demands attributed to the gods. Gods revealed to ritual specialists and lay persons alike that they desired well-kept temples, elaborate inscriptions, and abundant offerings in exchange for their assistance. Somewhat more controversially, Hansen also argues that merchants were pivotal in the spread of regional cults of the Five Manifestations (wu xian 五顯), Zitong 梓童, the Heavenly Consort (Mazu 馬祖), and king Zhang (Zhang wang 張王). Those cults spread from one locality to the larger surrounding areas, mostly along water transport routes. She notes that the opposition to regional cults among local literati such as Zhu Xi’s student Chen Chun who became infamous for his crusade against popular religious practices should be read as a rejection of regional identity among local literati. Merchants, however, appear not to have suffered from the more narrowly construed local biases of the literati.

More than ten years after Hansen’s work appeared, three other historians of the Song Dynasty turned to local religion. Robert Hymes’ *Way and Byway: Taoism, Local*

Religion, and Models of Divinity in Sung and Modern China is in some ways an extension of his earlier work on the elites of Fuzhou 撫州 (Jiangxi 江西). As in *Statesmen and Gentlemen* (1986) Fuzhou Prefecture lies at the center of this work. From Tang times onwards three immortals had been revered on Huagai 華蓋 Mountain in Fuzhou. Starting in the twelfth century the cult of the Three Perfected Lords spread across Fuzhou and other regions in Jiangxi. In his earlier work Hymes interpreted elite support for the cult as one of a set of activities that expressed the increasingly local consciousness and localist strategies of Southern Song elites. In *Way and Byway* Hymes presents his analysis of the Huagai cult as a theoretical contribution to the study of Chinese religion. The model of Chinese religion developed out of the case study of the Huagai cult is, as shown below, anchored to the localist paradigm developed in Hymes' earlier work.

Hymes presents two models for Chinese representations of divinity and of human relationships with the divine. The first model, the bureaucratic model, is familiar to students of Chinese religion and is commonly associated with Daoist religion. In this model divinities act as officials, divinities and lay believers are part of a larger organizational structure in which their status and place is determined by outside authorities and in which communication occurs through a hierarchical network. In the second model, the personal model, gods are extraordinary persons, the relationship between divinities and lay persons is independent of outside authorities, rooted in local places, and structured around the divinity's inherent rather than delegated power.

Hymes writes that these models are not mere ideal types, but that they were systematically applied in differing contexts by different actors in Song times. The

bureaucratic model characterized the activities of Daoist professionals. Hymes uses the example of the Celestial Heart Daoists, who also claimed Huagai Mountain as the site from which their doctrine originated. He argues that even though the bureaucratic model predated Celestial Master Daoism, it gained additional cloud through the activities of ritual masters who sold their services in an increasingly commercialized economy. The personal model expresses the worship of the Huagai immortals among the Fuzhou and Jiangxi elite. In Hymes' analysis, the worship of the Huagai immortals among Southern Song and Yuan elites represents their self-definition as local elites not tied to bureaucratic power. Even though he thus opposes professionals' and elites' conceptualizations of gods and human relationships with them, he rejects a clear distinction between clergy and elite models of divinity. He demonstrates that Daoist professionals tended to opt for the personal model in legitimizing their and their teachers' authority as well as in relationships among Daoist professionals themselves. As such, his findings echo Hansen's argument that in Song times direct communication between gods and believers became standard.

Two years after the publication of *Way and Byway*, Richard von Glahn, who had heretofore gained acclaim for his work on economic history and frontier development, came out with a history of Chinese religious culture that similarly reads as both a rethinking of scholarship on Chinese religion and an elaboration of the localist paradigm through the investigation of Song local religion. In *The Sinister Way: The Divine and the Demonic in Chinese Religious Culture* (2004), von Glahn opts for the use of "vernacular religion" over other terminology such as "popular" or "secular" religion used by earlier scholars to distinguish the religious beliefs and practices of laypersons from those of the

clergy. The term “vernacular” religion embodies von Glahn’s contention that, “in an important sense, in China all religion is local” (p. 11). In addition to its local roots, von Glahn stresses the various and shifting sets of religious ideologies from which vernacular religion draws. Vernacular religion is thus not diametrically opposed to the classical liturgical traditions of Daoism and Buddhism or to state religion, rather it is a language shared locally which continuously interacts with these other religious discourses.

Throughout the seven chapters of *The Sinister Way* Von Glahn presents a survey of major developments in Chinese religion between the Shang and Ming Dynasties. This survey is structured around his main contention that throughout their history Chinese religious beliefs and practices manifest two basic orientations: the propitiation of the gods and exorcism on the one hand, and the belief in the operation of moral equilibrium in the cosmos on the other hand. He writes that these two basic orientations are always in tension, and that both are characterized by the intervention of demonic forces, defined as gods and spirits with an inclination towards malevolence. *The Sinister Way* (the title translates the Chinese term “zuodao” 左道 which was opposed to the right or orthodox way or “zhengdao” 正道) focuses on the demonic in Chinese religious culture, on those powers, which, besides destiny, steered human lives in undesirable directions.

Within the context of these enduring fundamental orientations of Chinese religious culture, von Glahn detects two major transitions in imperial religious history. First, in Han times older ideas about gods as awe-inspiring ancestors were supplemented and overshadowed by new representations of the gods as at times pathetic and vengeful ghosts. The divine and the demonic were thus merged in popular representations of the gods. Second, following Hansen, Hymes, and Edward Davis (see below), von Glahn

defines laypersons' reliance on direct channels of communication with local gods as one of the major characteristics of "the Song transformation of Chinese religious culture" (Chapter 5). von Glahn calls this development "the vernacularization of ritual" and analyzes it in accordance with the definition of vernacular religion explained above, emphasizing the interaction between lay beliefs and practices and Buddhist and Daoist ideologies and ritual masters. In the chapters discussing Song and later imperial religious culture, von Glahn focuses on the Wutong 五通 cult as a case study of both the plasticity of Chinese representations of the divine and the ambivalence of divine beings. He writes that the cult of Wutong originated in mountain goblin lore, which expressed popular anxieties about unfamiliar territory. Wutong subsequently metamorphosed into a Buddhist saint delivering Wuyuan County 婺源 from epidemic disease, and, by the late Ming, had turned into a god of wealth across Jiangnan, once more exhibiting the capricious qualities of a god who both bestowed and took wealth at will.

In *The Sinister Way* von Glahn emphasizes the role of ritual masters over that of merchants in the spread of local and regional cults. This critique of the role of merchants highlighted in the work of both Valerie Hansen and David Johnson¹ had already been articulated at greater length in Edward Davis' *Society and the Supernatural in Song China* (2001). I treat this work last because its approach to the question of the connection between the Tang-Song transition and religious history differs from that taken in the three titles discussed above.

Whereas the analysis of Song local religion in Hansen, Hymes, and von Glahn invokes and fits into the paradigm of the Tang-Song transition, Davis rejects the

¹ David Johnson, "The City-God Cults of T'ang and Sung China," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 45.2 (1985): 363-457.

paradigm and proposes a different context for his research on spirit-possession and exorcism in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. He cautions readers against viewing his work within the Tang-Song transition paradigm because it represents in his reading a linear and teleological view projecting social change between the Tang and Song Dynasties as the progress of “the Confucian elite” towards social and cultural hegemony (p. 7). Instead, he proposes that we focus on tensions among social, political, and religious groups. He organizes these groups along a vertical axis, with the emperor and his court, and the bureaucratic and religious bureaucracies at the top; the new or expanding groups of lay Daoist exorcists (*fashi* 法師), esoteric Buddhist monks, doctors, ritual experts, and examination students and graduates without official positions in the middle; and, village spirit-mediums (*wu* 巫), Buddhist acolytes, sub-bureaucratic functionaries, local landowners, tenants, and servants at the bottom (p. 7).

Within this context he analyzes relations between Daoists priests, ritual masters and exorcists, and spirit-mediums, emphasizing shared interests and conflicts among these groups. While tensions among Daoist priests and spirit-mediums were not new in Song times, Davis argues that they intensified as a result of commercialization during the twelfth century. Commercialization also sustained the rise of ritual experts as mediators between Daoist liturgy, Buddhist ritual, and local religious beliefs and practices. Davis’ work is principally intended as a social and cultural history of the ritual experts of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. He attributes to this socially variegated group of experts a central role in the syncretization of beliefs and practices that are conventionally associated with discrete belief-systems such as Buddhism and Daoism or with particular social groups such as the village spirit-mediums. While the works reviewed thus far

equally stress the sharing of beliefs and practices across social boundaries and religious affiliations in local religion, Davis underscores that popular religion should not be conceived of as amorphous and diffused syncretism in opposition to organized state or elite religion. Following the scholar of Chinese religion Kenneth Dean, he proposes that Southern Song popular religion be analyzed as a “syncretic field,” an autonomous cultural arena of religious ritual in which the shared interests and tensions among social, political, and religious groups intersect.

The Return to Political History

The 1980s represented a breakthrough in American historical research on the Song Dynasty in terms of the number of people writing dissertations and publishing monographs that became instant classics in imperial Chinese history. Social, economic, and intellectual history were the most popular fields among the new Song historians; few if any of the newly minted historians wrote political history.² Political history’s lack of appeal among the new historians did not imply its absence in the historiography of the Song period in the 1980s. James T. C. Liu’s *China Turning Inward: Intellectual-Political Changes in the Early Twelfth Century* (1988) discussed the factionalist politics of the eleventh and twelfth centuries and the impact of the rise of the Learning of the Way (Daoxue 道學) on elite political culture.

The relative decline of research in political history ended in the 1990s. Since then a wide variety of monographs on Song political history and political culture has appeared.

² Lau Nap-yin (1986) was one exception.

Below I briefly survey the range of topics and approaches in works published between 1990 and 2006, and in the process suggest some reasons for the return to political history.

One impetus for this new trend has been the compilation of volume 5 of *The Cambridge History of China*. Similar to other multi-volume history sets published by Cambridge University Press, *The Cambridge History of China* is intended as a detailed and comprehensive survey of all of Chinese history. The project started in the 1960s and since 1978 twelve books have been published (not counting the related but separately published volume on Ancient China). Following the layout of a chronological overview of political history in part one and a thematic review of major trends in social, economic, intellectual, or religious history in part two of the other volumes in the series, two books are planned for the volume on the Five Dynasties and Song Dynasty. This arrangement underscores the editors' prioritization of political history. Preparations have been under way for well over a decade, but the first book of volume 5 has yet to appear. Regardless of its long gestation period, the compilation of The Song Dynasty volume of *The Cambridge History of China* has already left its impression on the field of Song history.

The best example of the way in which the project steered the research agendas of some of the more prominent historians of the 1980s, as well as a sign of the potential scholarly significance and utility of the volume, is Richard Davis' *Wind against the Mountain: The Crisis of Politics and Culture in Thirteenth-Century China* (1996). An outgrowth of the author's research for and drafts of three *Cambridge History* chapters on the last reigns of the Southern Song Dynasty, this work narrates the last years of the Song Dynasty. It does so from a different perspective than the one typically adopted in the political narratives of *The Cambridge History*. In *Wind against the Mountain* Richard

Davis ties political history to cultural history by describing cases of Song loyalism as expressions of cultural anxieties. Through the study of individual loyalists and martyrs he teases out male anxieties over Song material and cultural life, and over the balance (or perceived imbalance) of masculinity and femininity, the civil and the martial. Through its embrace of cultural history in the analysis of politics, *Wind against the Mountain* also demonstrates the impact of cultural history on the study of Song politics more broadly. Specifically, as compared to Davis' earlier work discussed below, it is an example of a subtle shift from the social history of Song politics to the analysis of political culture. This shift is especially evident in the work of the most recent generation of Song scholars, those who wrote dissertations in the last ten years.

A. The Social History of Politics

The dominance of social history questions and methods in the 1980s extended to the study of Song politics. The three monographs discussed below share an interest in the social history of political elites. Even though these works thus overlap with the social histories of Song elites written by Hartwell and Hymes, their primary focus on families at the pinnacle of the Song political hierarchy results in a critique of the localist paradigm at the heart of the social history of the 1980s.

Richard Davis' *Court and Family in Sung China, 960-1279: Bureaucratic Success and Kinship Fortunes for the Shih of Ming-chou* (1986) is an early example of the social history of politics.³ It examines the extraordinary bureaucratic success of the

³ John Chaffee (1985) can also be read as a social history of the civil service examinations. While work from the 1980s has generally been left out of consideration, I

Shi 史 lineage of Mingzhou 明州 (Ningbo 寧波). During the Southern Song period, this lineage produced three chief councilors; overall, the lineage produced more than 200 civil officials. Davis recognizes that the success of the Shi was atypical (only one other family managed to generate three consecutive generations of grand councilors), but argues that the principal method they used, the civil service examinations, also determined the political fortunes of their contemporaries and thus made them representative of their age.

Davis traces the rise of Shi males from positions in the sub-bureaucracy in the late eleventh century to the pinnacles of political power in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, describes their interactions with the political elite, and explains their role in Southern Song court policy. He concludes that their experience was rather different from that of the elites portrayed in the works of Hartwell and Hymes. First, Davis emphasizes that the Shi reached the top of the political hierarchy and acquired social standing through examination success and thereby refutes Hymes' finding that examination success merely confirmed social standing and typically followed marriage alliances with locally prominent families. Second, he contends that the reliance on examination success and bureaucratic service in the Shi lineage in Southern Song times questions Hartwell's thesis that the professional elite focused on bureaucratic service during the Northern Song period gave way to local lineages diversifying their strategies for success and investing in local settlement. In several respects, the Shi continued to act in ways similar to Hartwell's professional elite.

Whereas Davis focuses on the political success of one prominent lineage, Beverly Bossler broadly examines the social history of both Northern and Southern Song grand

am treating Davis' work here because of its close connection to the other works discussed in this section.

councilors, 133 men in total. In *Powerful Relations: Kinship, Status, and the State in Sung China (960-1279)* (1998) she contrasts the social backgrounds, marriages, and careers of grand councilors serving first in Kaifeng 開封 and then Lin'an 臨安 (Hangzhou 杭州) to the social backgrounds, marriages, and careers of the elite of one locality, Wuzhou 婺州. Culling her data mostly from funerary inscriptions (muzhiming 墓誌銘), Bossler concludes that the distinction between Northern Song and Southern Song elites as presented in the works of Hartwell and Hymes was more apparent than real. The families of top-ranking officials continued to marry outside of local networks in Southern Song times, and the lower bureaucracy during the Northern Song was staffed by elites that acted like Southern Song local elites. Bossler argues that the shift identified in earlier scholarship was largely the result of historiographical developments. The number of examination candidates and thus literate elites grew, and they generated more local records. She also suggests that the rise of the Learning of the Way (Daoxue) and its validation of elite involvement in local community projects in Southern Song and Yuan times resulted in the better preservation and in the celebration of records celebrating such activities.

Bossler's caveat about the differences in the Northern and Southern Song historiographical record does, however, not amount to a rejection of the localist paradigm. She points out that the transition from the Northern to the Southern Song was marked by significant social and political changes that gradually transformed life in the provinces. Whereas the top of the political elite settled down in Kaifeng during the Northern Song period, they dispersed to larger cities after the move of the court to Lin'an and never returned to the latter capital as a resident class of professional bureaucrats. Their dispersal

implied the extension of networking opportunities to other local elites. Ultimately, Bossler refuses to read the localist turn as simply localist. She concludes that the localist elite became important in Southern Song times because they were visible, politically, as a group. And, therefore, “the ‘local’ elite became historically important in the Song precisely—and paradoxically—because it became inextricably integrated with extra-local networks” (p. 208). This is illustrated in her findings on marriage patterns, which demonstrate that higher official status correlated with longer marriage distance. In Bossler’s reading, these Song patterns explain why classical education and state service continued as the most distinguishing markers of social status in later imperial China.

Shortly after the publication of Beverly Bossler’s work, another study of the relationships among “kinship, status, and the state” made its appearance. John Chaffee’s *Branches of Heaven: A History of the Imperial Clan of Sung China* (1999) examines the lives and careers of the imperial clan members of the founder of the Song Dynasty, Zhao Kuangyin. Even though wide-ranging in its overview of the social, political, and cultural activities of clan members, *Branches of Heaven* focuses on the ways in which the state regulated the lives of the male and female descendants of the emperor. Chaffee presents the lives of clan members not as the stories of family of the emperor but treats the clan as an extension of emperorship.

The clan was a source of successors to the throne and the emperor’s honoring ancestors and descendants alike legitimated his rulership. At the same time, as potential rivals, clan members presented a threat to the ruling emperor. Mindful of the political and financial implications of the maintenance of the imperial clan, Song emperors and politicians invested considerable time and effort in the definition of clan membership and

the regulation of clan member activities. Unlike their Tang predecessors, Song emperors eventually opted for a broad definition of clan membership, including all descendants without generational limits. This broad definition underscored, in Chaffee's view, the Song Dynasty's unprecedented understanding of the clan as a political institution and also shaped the subsequent history of imperial clans under the Ming and Qing Dynasties.

Chaffee's account of the history of the clan reinforces the localist paradigm, even while lending support to some of the revisions introduced by Bossler. During most of the Northern Song period imperial clansmen did not hold substantial office in the regular bureaucracy. Most clansmen lived in specially designated complexes in the capital and two other locations. After the dislocation attending the Jurchen invasions in the 1120s, clan members were allowed to take up residence across the south. Chaffee writes that their lives began to look more like those of the local elites in the areas where they settled down: they became local landowners, intermarried with local elite families, participated in local welfare projects, took civil service examinations, and became local magistrates.

Despite such similarities, clan members remained distinguished from the regular population in several ways. Their marriage patterns ranged locally as well extra-locally and thus looked more like those of higher officialdom examined in Bossler's work. Moreover, clansmen had access to special examinations and were more readily eligible to take up positions through yin privilege. Because of their political significance, members of the Zhao 趙 lineage were also discriminated against and were virtually excluded from ministerial and other top-level bureaucratic positions. Chaffee concludes that the imperial clan was foremost an institution created out of political considerations. Song emperors and politicians invented and reinvented institutions to keep track of the expansion of the

clan and to monitor the upbringing, marriages, and livelihood of clan members. Chaffee attributes their considerable success in avoiding the traditional court intrigues of imperial clan members to their understanding of the imperial clan as an essential part of emperorship.

B. Language and Politics

Apart from providing a stimulus to the social history of top-ranking officials, the localist paradigm also generated research into elite conceptualizations of the state and of the relationship between state and society. In 1986 around twenty historians met in Scottsdale, Arizona for a conference titled, “Sung Dynasty Statecraft in Thought and Action.” Ten of the papers presented at the conference were later published in the volume *Ordering the World: Approaches to State and Society in Song Dynasty China* (1993). In their introduction to the volume the editors, Conrad Schirokauer and Robert Hymes, explain that the participants were asked to consider how representatives and critics of the state dealt with the major social and political changes affecting Song society. They define those changes as 1) the decline of state power that must have accompanied the imperial state’s decision not to expand the bureaucracy as the population grew; 2) the Tang-Song transition marked by economic growth, the demographic shift to the south, and the decline of aristocratic families; 3) the Northern Song-Southern Song transition characterized by the elite’s social transformation outlined in the introduction above.

Synthesizing the findings of some of the papers, the editors propose that during the Southern Song a “middle level” or “middle space” emerged where local elites engaged in public activities such as academy and community granary building that

moved beyond the concern for family and fell outside the immediate control of the state. This middle space set the stage for the conceptualization of such activities as “public” (gong 公) in Ming and Qing times. In Song times these activities were typically associated with local community (she 社, xiang 鄉) and voluntary community action (yi 義). *Ordering the World* is thus a continuation of the scholarship on the social transformation of the elite: it explains the reconceptualization of state and society that attended the changing social strategies of Song elites, and, suggests that the shrinking of the state during the last millennium of Chinese imperial history was therefore the result of a historical choice, namely, the new contract between the state and the elites that emerged during the Southern Song.

Ordering the World was also a new departure from previous social and political history. The editors situate the volume not only in the context of debates within Song history (the localist paradigm) or late imperial history (the relationship between state and society), but also call for more systematic analysis of the political languages of Song literate elites. The editors refer here to the work of John Pocock who has written extensively on the political languages of early modern European elites. They propose, and Hymes demonstrates fruitfully in his essay on Huang Zhen and Dong Wei in the volume, that elites made strategic use of differing political languages in staking out their positions on particular topics of central or local political concern. Political languages were not only competing for literati attention, they were also subject to significant historical change. Based on a set of papers on statecraft and thirteenth-century representatives of the Learning of the Way (Zhen Dexiu, Wei Liaoweng, and Li Xichuan), the editors point out that the political language of the Learning of the Way (Daoxue) had

by the thirteenth century been through a significant change since Zhu Xi's time. The term "Daoxue" had come to refer to a much broader group of people, and users of the language of the Learning of the Way applied it to a wider range of interests also including those regarding central government and central government institutions.

The editors' call for similar conferences on statecraft has yet to be answered; the promise embedded in *Ordering the World* for more systematic analysis of imperial Chinese political languages has also been unfulfilled. One attempt to pursue this line of inquiry is Ari Levine's analysis of Northern Song factionalist discourse in "A House in Darkness: The Politics of History and the Language of Politics in the Late Northern Song, 1068—1104" (2002). In his dissertation Levine reviews several sets of texts relevant to the language and later representation of Northern Song factional conflict, including expositions on factions, texts regarding the compilation of veritable records for Northern Song reign periods, biographies of "traitorous ministers" in *The History of the Song Dynasty* (*Song shi* 宋史), and a sample of texts culled from private histories representing Northern Song factional discourse in political practice.

He sets out to demonstrate that these texts share a scheme of binary ethical oppositions (e.g., junzi 君子 vs. xiaoren 小人) and argues that they served, equally for opposing factions, to distinguish legitimate from illegitimate political practitioners. The adoption of this same binary language in official historiography, especially in *The History of the Song Dynasty*, alerts researchers that this source has to be read and examined as a secondary rather than a primary source—Levine reveals the characteristics of the factional language adopted in official historiography through a comparative analysis of edited Song biographies and their source texts. Levine concludes that, despite

their differences, Northern Song politicians shared a language of factionalism that ultimately denied political factions legitimacy. He intimates that the shift from Northern Song to Southern Song explored in the social history of the 1980s may also represent a linguistic shift, one in which local elites, especially those associated with the Learning of the Way identify themselves, and not their enemies, as a faction.

Art historians have been especially tuned into the political meanings of the artistic idioms of painting and calligraphy.⁴ In *The Upright Brush: Yan Zhenqing's Calligraphy and Song Literati Politics* (1998) Amy McNair writes that Ouyang Xiu and Cai Xiang promoted the calligraphy of the Tang calligrapher Yan Zhenqing over that of the imperially endorsed calligraphic style of the Southern Dynasties artist Wang Xizhi in a language that revealed its political and cultural overtones. They described Yan's style in terms like "forceful" and "upright" which connoted the political loyalism and martyrdom which they foregrounded in the reception of Yan's character as well as his calligraphic style.

Similarly, Alfreda Murck uncovers the language of dissent embedded in Song paintings and supporting poetry on the theme of "Eight Views of Xiao Xiang." In *Poetry and Painting in Song China: The Subtle Art of Dissent* (2000) she describes how eleventh-century landscape paintings, commonly read as representations of cosmic harmony, were infused with visual and literary codes which sympathetic and educated literati could decode as statements of frustration and criticisms of the factional politics of the late Northern Song period. Murck also proposes that it was the ability of amateur

⁴ In addition to the two monographs discussed below, see also the two Ph.D. dissertations in art history listed in the bibliography: Cheng (2003) and Hammers (2002).

literati painting to embody frustrations and political criticism covertly that explains its appeal to literate elites from the eleventh century onwards.

C. Classical Scholarship and Politics

It is commonly accepted among Chinese historians that knowledge of the classics and the ability to use classical texts in social and political exchanges were a defining characteristic of the scholar-officials. Few, however, have ventured to examine how Song classical scholarship shaped and was shaped by contemporary politics. Two studies published during the last ten years illustrate the potential of and the need for more research into the relationship between classical scholarship and Song political culture.

Alan Wood relates three Northern Song commentaries on *The Spring and Autumn Annals* (*Chunqiu* 春秋) to literati understandings of power and authority in *Limits to Autocracy: From Sung Neo-Confucianism to a Doctrine of Political Rights* (1995). He traces the history of northern Song commentaries on *The Annals* in two stages, arguing that approaches to that classic moved from an analysis of the moral and universal meaning of ritual (*li* 禮) in the commentaries of Sun Fu to the application and elaboration of the metaphysics of pattern (*li* 理) in the commentaries of Cheng Yi and Hu Anguo. In Wood's reading the authors of these commentaries, calling for "revering the emperor and expelling the barbarians" (*zun wang rang yi* 尊王讓夷), were not articulating a political philosophy intended to increase the *power* of the emperor, but rather a philosophy lending support to both the *authority* of the emperor and the power of the literati. Wood compares the Neo-Confucian philosophy of "heavenly principles" (*tian li* 天理) to the western notion of natural law and concludes that Song scholars' articulation of the

philosophy of heavenly principles served, as in the case of the philosophy of natural law, as a means to limit imperial power.

Hon Tze-ki similarly reads classical commentary as a vehicle for literati empowerment in his study of northern Song commentaries on *The Changes*, *The Yijing and Chinese Politics: Classical Commentary and Literati Activism in the Northern Song Period, 960-1127* (2005). Whereas Wood compares commentaries written at different points in time, Hon opts for “a synchronic comparison.” He divides the northern Song period into three segments (the early Northern Song 960-1022, the mid-Northern Song 1023-1085, and the late Northern Song 1086-1127) and reads the cluster of commentaries selected for each segment in its political and intellectual context. He argues that Hu Yuan’s *The Orally Transmitted Meanings of The Changes of Zhou* (*Zhou yi kouyi* 周易口義), along with commentaries by Ouyang Xiu and Li Gou, express the zeal among early Northern Song literati to participate in bureaucratic government. Zhang Zai’s *An Explanation of the Meanings of The Changes by Zhang Zai* (*Hengqu yi shuo* 橫渠易說), along with the commentaries by Sima Guang and Shao Yong, he interprets as programmatic statements for a moral metaphysics that expanded the scope of literati activism from bureaucratic politics to a broader civil governance that included their participation in molding social behavior. Finally, he connects the commentaries by Cheng Yi and Su Shi to the factionalist politics of the late northern Song and reads them as the reflections on history and politics of embattled politicians. Despite the differences in tone and emphasis among the Northern Song exegetes examined in this work, and indeed despite the differences between exegetes such as Zhang Zai and Cheng Yi who are typically grouped together as forerunners of the Learning of the Way (Daoxue), Hon

perceives a common thread running through Northern Song exegesis on *The Changes*. He concludes that a spirit of political activism, the literati belief in and aspiration for co-rulership of the empire, characterizes the classical exegesis of the Northern Song, and sees this as a reflection of the momentous sociopolitical changes inaugurated under the auspices of the Song Dynasty.

D. Loyalism

Past scholarship has identified loyalism, defined as an exclusive sense of loyalty to the reigning dynasty, as a political value that was expressed first in the writing of eleventh-century Song historians and subsequently in the acts of martyrdom and eremitism during the Song-Yuan transition.⁵ More recently three monographs have been devoted to the meanings and manifestations of loyalty and loyalism at both ends of the Song period.

Jennifer Jay's *A Change in Dynasties: Loyalism in Thirteenth-Century China* (1991) is a study of the divergent expressions of loyalism between 1273-1300. Jay emphasizes that a minority of Song subjects became loyalists and that an even smaller minority were loyalists in the strictest sense of the word: those who preferred death over life under a new regime and became martyrs for the Song cause. Besides the martyrs she studies two other types of loyalists consisting of those who refused to serve the new rulers in an official capacity and those who at first refused to take up positions but later served in low-level positions. The chapter on the historiography of Song loyalism

⁵ Wang Gungwu, "Feng Tao: An Essay on Confucian Loyalty," in Arthur Wright, ed., *Confucianism and Chinese Civilization* (New York: Antheneum, 1965), 188-210; Frederick Mote, "Confucian Eremitism in the Yuan Period," in Arthur Wright, ed., *Confucianism and Chinese Civilization*, 252-290.

critically reviews the sources and the perspectives used in the compilation of the biographies of loyal subjects in the official *History of the Song Dynasty (Song shi)* and concludes that myth-making has characterized the historiography of Song loyalism from the thirteenth through the twentieth century.

In contrast to the stereotype of the Song loyalist as an uncompromising and anti-foreign defender of the Song cause, Jay portrays characters whose loyalty is aimed at different objects, expressed in contradictory ways, and subject to regional variation. While high-profile loyalists and martyrs like Wen Tianxiang and Zhang Shijie exhibited loyalty to the Song state rather than the reigning emperor, the martyrdom and loyalism of many others was the result of personal loyalties to military superiors, husbands, and fathers. Even though centers of loyalist activity appear to have been predominantly located in southern China, southerners eventually followed northerners in pledging alliance to the reigning Yuan Dynasty. Jay argues that anti-foreign sentiment in the thirteenth-century south has been overestimated as a result of the appropriation of the Song loyalists' legacy among Ming loyalists and twentieth-century Chinese nationalists.

Richard Davis wrote a cultural history of Song loyalism in *Wind against the Mountain: The Crisis of Politics and Culture in Thirteenth-Century China* (1996), a title discussed in more detail in the introduction to the section on political history above. Davis considers several of the cases mentioned in Jay's work, but interprets loyalism as a cultural phenomenon designed to resolve a host of tensions and anxieties that characterized late Song society generally.

"The question of loyalty" is also at the center of Naomi Standen's dissertation "Frontier Crossings from North China to Liao, c.900-1005," to be published with

revisions in 2007 by Hawaii University Press as *Unbounded Loyalty: Frontier Crossings in Liao China*. Standen examines the history of the contested meanings of loyalty through a broad chronological survey and selected in-depth case-studies of border crossings from Chinese into Khitan Liao territory. Like Jay she analyzes historiographical shifts in the representation of her subject in contemporary and later biographical writing. Unlike Jay, she concludes that as the border became more clearly defined and separated two instead of more competing regimes, a process that culminated in the Treaty of Shanyuan between Song and Liao in 1005, loyalty came to be defined more and more in ethnic terms.

Pragmatism characterized the relatively frequent crossings of the early tenth century and prevailed in an atmosphere where civil and military men could choose from among a number of competing regimes none of which was dominant. In the second half of the tenth century fewer regimes remained and the remaining regimes began to withdraw power from military governors in outlying border prefectures to the political center in the capital. The Zhou and later the Song emperors simultaneously grew more concerned over crossings as symbols of illegitimacy. These regimes' demand for and the growing hold of loyalty lay reflected in the smaller number of crossings in the last decades of the tenth century, as well as in the increasingly negative portrayal of Chinese who crossed into Liao territory not only as disloyal subjects but also as threats to ethnic solidarity. Standen's work demonstrates convincingly how the definition of political boundaries affect the interpretation of loyalty and ethnic consciousness.

E. Political Biography

Political biography, typically in the form of a study of the political thought of individuals, has been a persistent if small genre in the field of Song political history. Starting with the studies of the political thought of Zhu Xi (Schirokauer, 1960), Sima Guang (Sariti, 1970), Ye Shi (Lo, 1974), and Chen Liang (Tillman, 1982), and continuing with more recent work on the politics of Zhen Dexiu (Chu, 1988) and Sima Guang (Ji, 2005), the systematic analysis of the careers and thoughts of individuals has proven to be fundamental in the reconstruction of Song politics. Song emperors have received scant scholarly attention,⁶ but that is about to be altered with the publication of *Emperor Huizong and Late Northern Song China: The Politics of Culture and the Culture of Politics*, edited by Patricia Ebrey and Maggie Bickford and forthcoming from the Harvard University Asia Center. Given that the latter title was not yet available to me at the time of writing, this section focuses on Ji Xiao-bin's recently published political biography of Sima Guang, *Politics and Conservatism in Northern Song China: The Career and Thought of Sima Guang (A.D. 1019-1086)* (2005).

Unlike general biographies of Sima Guang in Chinese or Japanese, Ji Xiao-bin focuses on Sima Guang's service under the three successive reigns of emperors Yingzong and Shenzong, and of Empress Dowager Gao. The author uses the careful analysis of Sima Guang's role in court politics and of his political views as an entry point into the rulership of northern Song emperors, especially with regards to the relationship between competing bureaucratic factions and the emperor. He demonstrates how northern Song emperors needed to contend with alternative sources of power such as top-ranking officials, regents, and crown princes or other potential successors. In Ji Xiao-bin's

⁶ There have been some dissertations but no recent monographs on Song emperors. See Lau (1986) and Hsu (2000).

analysis, Sima Guang's abiding support for imperial supremacy was intimately connected with a conservative view of family and imperial politics aimed at the preservation of scarce resources, the protection of the institutional status quo against institutional reform, and the hierarchical and ritual control over subordinates.

He explains that Sima Guang's ability to remain at court under widely differing regimes and his willingness to serve emperors whose policies he abhorred resulted from Sima's belief in the inviolability of imperial power and his responsibility in protecting it. It also resulted from the emperors' need for a system of checks and balances in the management of high officialdom. Even Shenzong, who wholeheartedly supported the reforms of Wang Anshi which Sima Guang attacked vehemently and in detail, kept Sima at court to serve as a continual reminder for the reformers of the source and dependent nature of their political power.

F. Future Prospects: Political Culture

In this review of the literature I have excluded monographs on Song legal, military, and diplomatic history. Even though noteworthy publications on these subjects have also appeared in recent years (see bibliography), and even though some of them are relevant to political history, space limitations do not allow me to include them here. I conclude briefly with some prospects on the future of American research on Song political history.

If recent Ph.D. dissertations are an indication, future publications touching on Song politics will encompass a wider variety of topics than before. Zhang Cong's dissertation on travel in Song times, "The Culture of Travel in Song China (960-1276)"

(2003), discusses the travel of officials as well as the varied uses of the government institutions and networks designed to facilitate travel. T.J. Hinrichs' dissertation, "The Medical Transforming of Governance and Southern Customs in Song Dynasty China (960-1279 C.E.)" (2003), discusses the Song state's attempts at transforming healing practices through the compilation, printing, and distribution of medical texts and the creation of state institutions for healthcare and medical training. The topics as well as the perspectives and methodologies adopted in these and related titles such as Ari Levine's work discussed above demonstrate the impact of cultural history on the study of Song politics. My own work, "The Composition of Examination Standards: *Daoxue* and Southern Song Dynasty Examination Culture" (1998) forthcoming from the Harvard University Asia Center under the title *Competition over Content: Negotiating Standards for the Civil Service Examinations in Imperial China (1127-1276)*, similarly approaches the civil service examinations as a bounded cultural space within which representatives of the state and literati in various capacities negotiate standards for examination preparation. As an analysis of the intellectual history of examination preparation, and following up on earlier institutional and social histories of the Song civil service examinations, it opens up new ways in which to view an institution typically associated with the centralization of imperial power during the Song Dynasty.⁷ The final shape these recent studies will take in published form and the impact they will have on the field of Song history remain to be examined in future review articles.

⁷ For an overview of the main arguments made in this work, see Hilde De Weerd, "Sōdai kakyō ni okeru gakujutsu no rekishi 宋代科挙における学術の歴史," *Chūgoku shakai to bunka* 中国社会と文化, forthcoming, 2007.

Bibliography of Recent Monographs and Dissertations

1. Song Religious History

Davis, Edward L. *Society and the Supernatural in Song China*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2001.

Eskildsen, Stephen. *The Teachings and Practices of the Early Quanzhen Taoist Masters*. Albany: State University of New York, 2004.

Gerritsen, Anne. "Gods and governors: interpreting the religious realm in Ji'an (Jiangxi) during the Southern Song, Yuan, and Ming dynasties." Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard University, 2001.

Gregory, Peter N. and Daniel A. Getz, Jr., eds. *Buddhism in the Sung*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999.

Ebrey, Patricia Buckley and Peter N. Gregory, eds. *Religion and Society in Tang and Sung China*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1993.

Halperin, Mark. "Pieties and Responsibilities: Buddhism and the Chinese Literati, 780-1280." Ph.D. dissertation, University of California at Berkeley, 1997. Revised in: *Out of the Cloister: Buddhism in Elite Lay Discourse in Sung China, 960-1279*. Harvard University Asia Center, forthcoming.

Hansen, Valerie. *Changing Gods in Medieval China, 1127-1276*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990.

Hymes, Robert P. *Way and Byway: Taoism, Local Religion, and Models of Divinity in Sung and Modern China*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.

Katz, Paul R. *Images of the Immortal: The Cult of Lü Dongbin at the Palace of Eternal Joy*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999.

Katz, Paul R. *Demon Hordes and Burning Boats: The Cult of Marshal Wen in Late Imperial Chekiang*. Albany : State University of New York Press, 1995.

Kleeman, Terry F. *A God's Own Tale: The Book of Transformations of Wenchang*. Albany : State University of New York Press, 1994.

Levering, Miriam. "Ch'an Enlightenment for Laymen: Ta-Hui and the New Religious Culture of the Sung: A Thesis." Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard University, 1978.

Liao, Hsien-hui. "Popular Religion and the Religious Beliefs of the Song Elite, 960—1276." Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, Los Angeles, 2001.

McRae, John R. *Seeing through Zen: Encounter, Transformation, and Genealogy in Chinese Chan Buddhism*. Berkeley : University of California Press, 2003.

Von Glahn, Richard. *The Sinister Way: The Divine and the Demonic in Chinese Religious Culture*. Berkeley, CA : University of California Press, 2004.

Clart, Philip. *Bibliography of Western Language Publications on Chinese Popular Religion (1995-present)*

http://web.missouri.edu/~religpc/bibliography_CPR.html

2. Political History

Bielenstein, Hans. *Diplomacy and Trade in the Chinese World, 589-1276*. Leiden: Brill, 2005.

Bossler, Beverly Jo. *Powerful Relations: Kinship, Status, & the State in Sung China (960-1279)*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998.

Chaffee, John W. *Branches of Heaven: A History of the Imperial Clan of Sung China*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999.

Cheng, Wen-chien. "Images of Happy Farmers in Song China (960-1279): Drunks, Politics, and Social Identity." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Michigan, 2003.

Chu, Ron-Guey. "Chen Te-Hsiu and the "Classic on Governance": The Coming of Age of Neo-Confucian Statecraft." Ph. D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1988.

Davis, Richard L. *Court and Family in Sung China, 960-1279: Bureaucratic Success and Kinship Fortunes for the Shih of Ming-Chou*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1986.

Davis, Richard L. *Wind against the Mountain: The Crisis of Politics and Culture in Thirteenth-Century China*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996.

De Weerd, Hilde. "The Composition of Examination Standards: Daoxue and Southern Song Dynasty Examination Culture." Ph. dissertation, Harvard University, 1998. Revised in: *Competition over Content, Negotiating Standards for the Civil Service Examinations in Imperial China (1127-1279)*. Harvard University Asia Center, forthcoming.

Ebrey, Patricia Buckley and Maggie Bickford, eds. *Emperor Huizong and Late Northern Song China: The Politics of Culture and the Culture of Politics*. Harvard University Asia Center, forthcoming.

Hammers, Roslyn Lee. "The Production of Good Government: Images of Agrarian Labor in Southern Song (1127-1279) and Yuan (1272/1279-1368) China." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Michigan, 2002.

Hinrichs, T.J. "The Medical Transforming of Governance and Southern Customs in Song Dynasty China (960-1279 C.E.)." Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard University, 2003.

Hon, Tze-Ki. *The Yijing and Chinese Politics: Classical Commentary and Literati Activism in the Northern Song Period, 960-1127*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2005.

Hsu, Yeong-huei. "Song Gaozong and His Chief Councilors: A Study of the Formative Stage of the Southern Song Dynasty." Ph.D. dissertation, The University of Arizona, 2000.

Ji, Xiao-bin. *Politics and Conservatism in Northern Song China: The Career and Thought of Sima Guang (A.D.1019-1086)*. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 2005.

Lau, Nap-yin. "The Absolutist Reign of Sung Hsiao-Tsung (R. 1163-1189)." Ph.D. dissertation, Princeton University, 1986.

Levine, Ari. "A House in Darkness: The Politics of History and the Language of Politics in the Late Northern Song, 1068—1104." Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 2002.

Lo, Winston Wan. *The Life and Thought of Yeh Shih*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University of Hong Kong Press, 1974.

Lorge, Peter Allan. *War, Politics and Society in Early Modern China, 900-1795*. London: Routledge, 2005.

McKnight, Brian E. *Law and Order in Sung China*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

McNair, Amy. *The Upright Brush: Yan Zhenqing's Calligraphy and Song Literati Politics*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1998.

Murck, Alfreda. *Poetry and Painting in Song China: The Subtle Art of Dissent*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center for the Harvard-Yenching Institute, 2000.

Sariti, Anthony. "The Political Thought of Ssu-ma Kuang: Bureaucratic Absolutism in the Northern Sung." Ph.D. dissertation, Georgetown University, 1970.

Sen, Tansen. *Buddhism, Diplomacy, and Trade: The Realignment of Sino-Indian Relations, 600-1400*. Honolulu : University of Hawai'i Press, 2003.

Schirokauer, Conrad. "The Political Thought and Behavior of Chu His." Ph.D. dissertation, Stanford University, 1960.

Standen, Naomi. "Frontier Crossings from North China to Liao, c.900-1005." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Durham (England), 1994." Revised in: *Unbounded Loyalty: Frontier Crossings in Liao China*. Honolulu: Hawaii University Press, forthcoming.

Tillman, Hoyt Cleveland. *Utilitarian Confucianism: Ch'en Liang's Challenge to Chu Hsi*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1982.

Wang, Xueliang. "Ideal Versus Reality: General Han Shizhong and the Founding of the Southern Song, 1127-1142." Ph.D. dissertation, The University of Arizona, 2000.

Wright, David Curtis. *From War to Diplomatic Parity in Eleventh-Century China: Sung's Foreign Relations with Kitan Liao*. Leiden: Brill, 2005.

Zhang, Cong. "The Culture of Travel in Song China (960-1276)." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Washington, 2003.

3. Other Works Cited

Bol, Peter Kees. "This Culture of Ours": Intellectual Transitions in T'ang and Sung China. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1992.

Chaffee, John W. *The Thorny Gates of Learning in Sung China: A Social History of the Examinations*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995 (1985).

Clark, Hugh R. *Community, Trade, and Networks: Southern Fujian Province from the Third to the Thirteenth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.

Hartwell, Robert M. "Demographic, Political, and Social Transformations of China, 750-1550." *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 42, no. 2 (1982): 365-442.

Liu, James T. C. *China Turning Inward. Intellectual-Political Changes in the Early Twelfth Century*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988.

Smith, Paul J. *Taxing Heaven's Storehouse: Horses, Bureaucrats, and the Destruction of the Sichuan Tea Industry, 1074-1224*. Cambridge, MA: Council on East Asian Studies, 1991.

Walton, Linda A. *Academies and Society in Southern Sung China*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999.